Reviewer’s report

Title: Hip fracture fixation in the below-knee amputee - a surgical dilemma: A case report.

Version: 3 Date: 30 January 2008

Reviewer: Amit Sinha

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

The authors have presented an unusual situation in clinical practice and have given different solutions. I would like them to include in their article the reasons why they chose a particular solution to their problem. They could include in the discussion the use of femoral pin traction as well, which would be very useful in displaced fracture neck of femur. Is there a place for conservative treatment in undisplaced fractures?

What next?: Revise and resubmit

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published