Reviewer's report

Title: Gene Expression Analysis Reveals Impaired Mitochondriogenesis and Adipogenesis in Adipose Tissue from a Patient with Acquired Partial Lipodystrophy (Barraquer-Simons Syndrome): a case report

Version: 2 Date: 13 May 2008

Reviewer: Luc Penicaud

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 9 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Findings that shed new light on the possible pathogenesis of a disease or an adverse effect

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This is an interesting and original case report demonstrating some abnormalities in the adipose tissue biology of a patient with acquired partial lipodystrophy. These abnormalities must explain in part the syndrome.

Although the authors underline the decreased PPAR# expression, they do not comment at all on the absence of effect on another master gene in term of adipogenesis i.e. CEBP#. This should deserve some explanations. How one can reconcile these two observations.

It is indicated that the patient was first seen at age 44, but it is not at what time was the tissue sampling done?

Was the patient under any medications? If yes, this must be indicated.

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests