Reviewer's report

Title: Disseminated cutaneous Herpes Simplex Virus-1 in a patient with rheumatoid arthritis receiving Infliximab: A case report.

Version: 3 Date: 3 January 2008

Reviewer: M Benucci

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

Take in consideration my comments

1) At the begining of disese the autors don't reported the dosage of Methotrexate, Sulphasalazyn, Leflunomide and Etanercept, and also the time of therapy for every single drug.

2) Also for after swithing to Infliximab the autors don't report the Infliximab dose.

3) In the discussion the autors don't explain the possibile correlation between infection of HSV-1 and the immune state of patient. In particular in every switch therapy don't report the exam such us lymphocyte sub-populations. The role of Infliximab on cito-toxicity antibody-dependent on CD14 cells but also on CD56 that have a role in the host defence to infections. For Adalimumab and the Etanercept the mechanism is different. This problem must be introduced
and explained.

4) In every switch therapy (from DMARD to biologic blocking agents) wasn't reported the activity of patient in term of DAS28 or ACR and therefore the case worsening was not documented by clinical but also inflammatory parameters ESR and PCR.

All this revisions are necessary for pubblication in your Journal.

The case is not suitable to be published on your Journal in this version.

What next?: Revise and resubmit

Quality of written English: Acceptable