Reviewer's report

Title: Thoraco-lumbar hyperostosis and enchondromatosis in a girl with achondroplasia

Version: 4 Date: 23 January 2008

Reviewer: Christine Hall

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: New associations or variations in disease processes

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

Unfortunately all three images (too few) are of extremely poor quality. They do not confirm a diagnosis of achondroplasia, or of enchondromatosis (Ollier’s disease) or of thoraco-lumbar hyperostosis. This paper will need to rely on much better imaging. I suggest that the changes at the metaphyses should be described as cartilage ‘rests’ which are seen in a large proportion of skeletal dysplasias where the cartilage growth plate is disrupted histologically. Similarly the term hyperostosis is not warrented by the minor spurs illustrated. Using the terms 'enchondromatosis' and 'hyperostosis' in a patient with an FGFR3 mutation implies some common molecular pathogenesis which is not warrented.

What next?: Reject

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited