Reviewer’s report

Title: Pulmonary fibrosis secondary to siderosis causing symptomatic respiratory disease: a case report

Version: 2 Date: 22 December 2007

Reviewer: Pan-Chyr Yang

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: An unexpected association between diseases or symptoms

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

The author in this manuscript described a case of pulmonary siderosis secondary to inhalation of iron compounds. The chest x-ray and CT suggest the presence of reticular nodular infiltrates, and video thoracoscopic biopsy revealed hemosiderin pigments accumulation in lung tissue. The lung function did not show any progression in 3 year follow up.

1. The histology of lung biopsy did not provide support for lung fibrosis. Please replace with at least one image that can confirm the presence of extensive fibrotic changes after iron inhalation.

2. Some granuloma is observed in histology. This should be mentioned and discussed.

What next?: Revise and resubmit

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published