Reviewer's report

Title: Pulmonary fibrosis secondary to siderosis causing symptomatic respiratory disease: a case report

Version: 2 Date: 26 August 2007

Reviewer: Chong-Jen Yu

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General
The authors demonstrate a case with interstitial lung disease containing iron in the interstitium of lung pathology. Both the chest images and pathology figures are compatible with pulmonary siderosis. The article is well written and readable. Although pulmonary siderosis is thought commonly present in welders, intersitial lung fibrosis with clinical symptoms is not as commonly described. With this, the report has clinical merits.

Revisions necessary for publication
The authors should demonstrate fibrosis in the lung, special staining for collagen fiber is necessary.

What next?: Accept after minor revisions

Quality of written English: Acceptable