Reviewer’s report

Title: Tongue metastasis as an initial presentation of renal cell carcinoma. A case report and review of literature

Version: 4 Date: 5 April 2008

Reviewer: Masakatsu Fukuda

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 9 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The authors described that primary tumour of the kidney metastasizing to the tongue is very unusual and its diagnosis is a challenge. The authors concluded that since the tongue is a rare metastatic site, when a lesion is detected, a thorough evaluation to distinguish between metastasis and primary cancer should be made as the management and prognosis varies. However, I have several concerns on the manuscript listed below.

1. There is no pathological data showing that renal cell carcinoma absolutely metastasized to the tongue. Concerning this point, the authors should determine the evidence of that.

2. This case may actually be rare, however, this is not only one case all over the world. Therefore, I think that authors should collect multiple cases of metastasis lesion and discuss retrospectively.

3. The prognosis and approach to therapy of this case are unclear.
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.