Reviewer’s report

Title: Tongue metastasis as an initial presentation of renal cell carcinoma. A case report and review of literature

Version: 4 Date: 28 March 2008

Reviewer: mahesh goel

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 9 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Authors have not mentioned the work-up performed at the time of initial diagnosis suspecting it to be a tumor of the tongue. Also, a little more detail of histo-pathology of renal tumor should be provided.

Paragraph 1 in discussion mentions the prevalence of disease to be 0.2% and a reference given. My view is that tongue metastasis from renal cancer is rare so prevalence is difficult calculate.

Author quotes that in this case there were no signs of chest symptoms, however the CT scan indicated presence of metastasis in the chest. Most probably this patient had chest metastasis at the time of presentation, although clinical signs were absent or were not detectable.

Table 1 provides names of all the authors and their cases, however a column should be added to Table 1 with the journal references. This can be done in presence of constraints on the total number of references.
The figure showing tumor is amazing, a nice picture and a nice case.

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'