Reviewer's report

Title: Pelvic-ureteric junction obstruction (PUJO) in the lower pole moiety of a duplex kidney with an associated intra parenchymal abscess: Case Report

Version: 1 Date: 18 February 2008

Reviewer: VIDYADHAR MALI

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 9 criteria for evaluation in the journal: New associations or variations in disease processes

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

Duplex kidneys are one of the common problems seen by paediatric urologists; but adult presentation is rare. Furthermore, PUJO in the lower moiety is rare and an associated intrarenal abscess is rarer still, if not unknown.

Nevertheless, kindly answer the following queries/make changes and resubmit:

1) Abstract
   Please what is the "initial investigation" and "further investigations"
   Specify where is the hydronephrosis in the duplex kidney
   Elaborate full form of PUJ
   What is the basis for saying that this is a "complication" due to the duplex anomaly? (see below)

2) Introduction
   Is their associated VUR--the case report does not mention whether a voiding cystourethrogram was performed!!!! This is an elementary investigation of any
duplex anomaly. Commonly, there is either VUR or VUJO leading to an infection.

Spell check: congenital

Infected PUJO- Elaborate full form, is their basis for claiming as infected (Does VCUG show VUR or MRU show VUJO?)

3) Case report

Clarify - "hydronephrotic right kidney" which moiety?

CT-elaborate full form

Was the abscess not seen on US or CT?

MR-elaborate full form

"Several days antibiotics"-how many, what antibiotics?

Was DMSA done?

Did you evaluate functional obstruction by diuretic renography?

When was pyeloplasty performed? Were any modifications applied to the pyeloplasty?

What was the follow-up?

4) Discussion

Is their a reference for an aberrant artery causing an obstruction to the upper moiety?

VUJ-elaborate full form

Grammar- causes of a hydronephrotic lower moiety..... include (not includes)

Spell check: periuretec

"Often the diagnosis is only made in adulthood"- i think any paediatric urologist would disagree. Please give reference or retract/ change the statement.

spell check: pyrexial?

Explain -- if the ureter is short then a pyeloureterostomy may be considered. Do the authors mean pyelopyelostomy?

What next?: Revise and resubmit

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published