Reviewer's report

Title: Successful transureteropyeloneostomy after heminephrectomy of a double-hydronephrotic horse shoe kidney

Version: 4 Date: 16 April 2008

Reviewer: mayank Mohan mohan agarwal

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 9 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Other

If other, please specify:

it presents a novel surgical management-strategy in known congential anomaly

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The manuscript has been appropriately modified and the English is now reasonably comprehensible, although there is still scope for some language-modification. Understanding the anatomy with the diagrams provided and considering poor follow up potential of the index patient, the authors have undertaken a logical and novel surgical approach which deserves appreciation. The discussion is relevant and concentrates on the central point of the article.

I would insist to incorporate the following figures rather than line diagrams-
1. MAG-3 scan, most importantly pre & post diuretic pyelogram images and corresponding graph
2. intraoperative retrograde ureterography image (left side)
3. intraoperative anastomosis images
4. postoperative IVU (after stent removal)

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.