Reviewer's report

**Title:** Successful transureteropyeloneostomy after heminephrectomy of a double-hydronephrotic horse shoe kidney

**Version:** 3  **Date:** 28 January 2008

**Reviewer:** Gralf gp Popken

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Presentations, diagnoses and/or management of new and emerging diseases

**Has the case been reported coherently?:** No

**Is the case report authentic?:** Yes

**Is this case worth reporting?:** No

**Is the case report persuasive?:** Yes

**Does the case report have explanatory value?:** Yes

**Does the case report have diagnostic value?:** Yes

**Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?:** Yes

**Comments to authors:**

- General comments
  This is an interesting case report handling urogenital congenital malformation as horse shoe kidney with urinary transport problems. This disease often takes individual strategies as described. This article is interesting for every urologist handling such patients.

- Revisions necessary for publication
  minor
  It should be clearly pointed out:
  1. why this kind of operation had to be done
  2. what steps of operative corrections had to be done e.g. illustrations

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal

**What next?:** Accept after minor revisions
Quality of written English: Acceptable