Reviewer's report

Title: Mucinous cystadenoma of the appendix mimicking cystic hydatid disease: a case report

Version: 2 Date: 11 February 2008

Reviewer: Matthias H Seelig

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: An unexpected association between diseases or symptoms

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

1. In the second paragraph (case report) the reader is referred to a CT scan of the abdomen (Figure 1 A and B) with suspected calcifications. At least from Figure 1B it is evident that the lesion does not protrude from the liver but is a extrahepatic tumor. The presence of calcifications is also illusive. If calcifications are clearly visible the corresponding ultrasound image should be provided demonstrating posterior acoustic shadowing. In addition, the coronal view given in figure 1B demonstrates a bean like lesion which is untypical for the cystic appearance of echinococcus granulosus. It was rather typical for a mucocele of the appendix. For the reader it should be clear that the lesion was misdiagnosed as hydatid disease. At least from the imaging material provided this is implied.

2. The lesion stems from the ileoceal area as written in the legend of the CT san. I wonder why no further gastrointestinal diagnostic procedure was performed such as colonoscopy or a virtual colonoscopy. It should be mentioned whether the patient underwent colonoscopy during follow-up. It should be stated that follow-up is important due to the potential of metachronic cancer or pseudomyxoma peritonei despite the fact that the mucocele was not perforated.
3. I think that the case reported here is an important example for potential misdiagnosis of a mucocele of the appendix which is a rare tumor. The title of the manuscript should be changed to: mucinous castadenoma of the appendix misdiagnosed as cystic hydatid disease of the liver.

4. It remains to be explained why albendazole therapy was given despite a negative titer for echinococcosis.

What next?: Accept after minor revisions

Quality of written English: Acceptable