Reviewer's report

Title: Factitious Lymphoedema - A psychiatric condition mimicking Reflex Sympathetic Dystrophy: A case report

Version: 3 Date: 24 January 2008

Reviewer: Bruno Gerber

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Findings that shed new light on the possible pathogenesis of a disease or an adverse effect

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

-This case report describes a very valuable differential diagnosis to RSD which in itself is often not recognised early enough. In particular pointing out the unusually long duration of the interval between the consolidation of the fracture and the manifestation of dystrophic symptoms as well as the demarcation help setting of an early correction of the treatment strategy, all the more than for RSD cases in general a psychological overlay is often assumed.

-For the sake of nomenclature the case should be presented as a "distal radius fracture" as it is not a typical Colles fracture and for the core of the report it makes no difference.

-In the discussion the most efficient treatment of RSD should not be omitted: Specially since available as a nasal spray the Calcitonin treatment has become much easier.

What next?: Accept after minor revisions

Quality of written English: Acceptable