Reviewer’s report

Title: Coexistence of Primary adenocarcinoma of the lung and Tsukamurella pneumonia: a case report and review of the literature.

Version: 2 Date: 3 December 2007

Reviewer: Mireille M Kattar

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This article reports a case of Tsukamurella infection that occurred in a patient who was concomitantly diagnosed with primary lung carcinoma presenting as a cavitative lesion.

General Comments:

The write-up of the manuscript is clear overall but needs improvement. A conceptual error about the taxonomy of the genus Tsukamurella should be corrected.

Specific Comments:

- In the abstract, â##Tsukamurella pneumonisâ## should be changed to â##Tsukamurella pulmonisâ##.

- On Page 3, the first sentence in the paragraph â##Case Presentationâ## should be replaced by:

  â##A 71-year-old Chinese man previously healthy, presented to our clinic with a
three-month history of episodic cough with production of thick yellow sputum.

- Second paragraph on Case Presentation, replace where he lived by where he had lived.

- Page 4: the first sputum sample grew. The word was should be deleted.

- Page 4: Third paragraph, second line: replace concern with suspicion.

- Page 4: Third paragraph, third line: Mycobacterium should be with capital M.

- Page 4: line before last should be replaced by regimen.

- Page 4, third paragraph, lines 3 and 4: specify how the organism was identified in the laboratory. Microbiological studies is too vague.

- Page 5: first paragraph line 2: replace thyroid specialist with endocrine specialist.

- Page 5: first paragraph line 3: replace biopsy by aspiration.

- Page 5, first paragraph line 9, clarify and replace no evidence of the organism was found in the samples by the organism was not identified on tissue sections OR acid-fast stain of tissue sections and there was no evidence of an inflammatory reaction.

- Page 5, second paragraph, lines 1, 2, and 3: there is a conceptual error about the taxonomy of the genus Tsukamurella. Replace the first sentence by Originally described human pathogens in 1982 (1), members of the genus Tsukamurella belong to the aerobic actinomycetes and are phylogenetically related to species of the Rhodococcus, Nocardia and Mycobacterium genera.

- Page 5, second paragraph, last sentence which is continued on Page 6: one cannot compare bacteria to fungi, delete this sentence altogether.

- Page 6, first paragraph, second line: replace Mycobacterial by mycobacterial.

- Page 6, first paragraph, line 5, replace cavitations by cavitation.

- Page 6, second paragraph, line 4: replace foreign-body infections by infections related to a foreign-body.

- Page 6, second paragraph, line 5: replace degree of acid-fast staining by intensity of acid-fast staining.

- Page 7: first paragraph line 3: replace limited sampling size and location by a low bacterial load and/or sampling error.
- Page 7: first paragraph, line 10: replace â##pneumonia from Tsukamurellaâ## by â##pneumonia due to Tsukamurellaâ##.

- Page 7, first paragraph, list the reference(s) where the treatment regimen was initially described as being effective.

- Page 7, first paragraph, last line: replace â##it may be useful to test for sensitivityâ## by â##it may be useful to perform in vitro susceptibility studiesâ##. Add â##However, there are no interpretative breakpoints for the genus Tsukamurellaâ##.

Page 7, â##Conclusionsâ## paragraph: last line, replace (or anti-tuberculosis) by â##anti-tuberculousâ## without parentheses.

Page 8: delete â##have a low thresholdâ## replace sentence by â##should evaluate patients for malignancy if they fail to respond to appropriate antimicrobial therapyâ##.

Page 8: list of abbreviations: delete â##MAI-Mycobacterium avium-intracellulare complexâ## since it is not used elsewhere in the manuscript.

Page 10: Table 1 caption: replace â##from other causes of cavitary pneumoniaâ## by â##from other bacteria causing cavitary pneumoniaâ##.

Page 10: Figure 1 caption: second line, replace â##left upper and lower lobeâ## by â##left upper and lower lobesâ##.

Page 11: Reduce the number of CT Scan images from 4 to 2.

**What next?:** Accept after minor revisions

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published