Reviewer's report

Title: Mediastinal pancreatic pseudocyst with isolated thoracic symptoms: a case report

Version: 4 Date: 14 November 2007

Reviewer: Igor Stipancic

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Presentations, diagnoses and/or management of new and emerging diseases

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General

Revisions necessary for publication

I carefully red corrected manuscript as well as authors comments.

On page 2 authors stated
"We have added that the patient suffered from chronic pancreatitis in the abstract"

I am sorry but I can't see that. Please se Case report in abstract.

"Case report:

We present the case of a 55-year-old man who was admitted due to intermittent dyspnea, dysphagia and weight loss. Chest x-ray, CT and MRI revealed a large paracardial pancreatic pseudocyst causing cardiac and esophageal compression."
Chronic pancreatitis is not mentioned in this section. Please make change.

In Conclusion of the abstract I remarked previously "it is not true that in mediastinal pancreatic pseudocysts present with acute exacerbation of pancreatitis"

The authors say: We have corrected this in the conclusion section. In addition we have cited the suggested reference (Mohl et al 2004).

"Conclusion:
In most cases of mediastinal pancreatic pseudocysts, patients present with acute exacerbation of pancreatitis, but isolated thoracic symptoms may occur. For accurate diagnostic and therapy planning, a multimodal imaging approach is necessary."

As You see the authors did not change that. The text is as follows "In most cases of mediastinal pancreatic pseudocysts, patients present with acute exacerbation of pancreatitis".

Again I stress: it is not true that in mediastinal pancreatic pseudocysts patients present with acute exacerbation of pancreatitis. (see references 3, 6, 7, 8 10, 16 cited in this article)

Generally pseudocysts in chronic pancreatitis most often are found in the absence of a recent attack of acute pancreatitis. It is true that they may develop after an episode of acute attack but more often they appear insidiously.

Page 4. Case presentation

The authors have added relevant laboratory findings. I suggest to write the values of amylase and lipase levels in cystic fluid (line 7 and 8) after imaging studies actually after CT scan or MR because I suppose the puncture and determination of cystic fluid was done after CT or MR examination. Namely at first they had to confirm that the lesion is cystic (by CT or MR) and afterwards analyse the cystic content (fluid). So please change that because it is logical medical approach.

Page 8. last paragraph.

This is authors text after revision.

"Mediastinal pseudocysts are a rare complication of pancreatitis. They most often appear in the setting of acute exacerbation of an underlying chronic pancreatitis, but can also present with unspecific symptoms including dyspnea and dysphagia. The case illustrates that this entity should be kept in mind as differential diagnosis in the evaluation of mediastinal masses in patient with a
history of pancreatitis. For accurate diagnosis and therapy planning, a multimodal imaging approach is necessary."

Again it is not true that in mediastinal pancreatic pseudocysts patient present with acute exacerbation of pancreatitis. Generally pseudocysts in chronic pancreatitis most often are found in the absence of a recent attack of acute pancreatitis. They may develop after an episode of acute attack but more often they appear insidiously.

Please make changes as it is advised.

Sincerely
Igor Stipancic, MD, PHD
Professor of Surgery,
Clinical Hospital "Dubrava" Zagreb
Croatia

What next?: Accept after minor revisions

Quality of written English: Acceptable