Reviewer's report

Title: Gastrointestinal cyst attached to the gallbladder: a case report

Version: 5 Date: 23 January 2008

Reviewer: stavros daliakopoulos

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

This case is interesting and very detailed although some parts not focused. Perhaps an even more attractive title: Heterotopic gastrointestinal tissue presenting as chronic cholecystitis „should be more precise regarding the clinical evaluation of the patient.

As regards the exact embryonic stages of the gastrointestinal tract :shorten this part and focus on the relevant points.

The authors present in the abstract as `dubious data`the ultra-sonographic findings between `a stone` and a `cyst`?. This part should perhaps be re-evaluated.

The interesting finding of this report is that tissue from a common origin can present in an uncommon anatomical position and mimic a complete different pathogenesis. This perhaps should be outlined

"The simultaneous occurrence..." is a very interesting theory but should be underlined with a citation from the literature.

What next?: Revise and resubmit
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published