Reviewer's report

Title: Adenocarcinoma of the bladder following nephrogenic adenoma: a Case report.

Version: 2 Date: 25 November 2007

Reviewer: Marcus Quek

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: New associations or variations in disease processes

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General

Revisions necessary for publication

The authors describe a case of a 25-year-old male who developed a possible malignant transformation of a nephrogenic adenoma to an adenocarcinoma. I have the following comments/questions:

1. Several spelling and grammatical errors need to be addressed prior to submission.

2. The malignant potential of nephrogenic adenomas in the bladder is controversial. A recently described entity that may be histologically similar to adenocarcinoma is fibromyxoid nephrogenic adenoma (Hansel DE et al, Am J Surg Path 31: 1231, 2007). The histologic description of the current case is strikingly similar to this entity which can mimic mucinous adenocarcinoma. Could the present case be interpreted as a fibromyxoid nephrogenic adenoma?

3. Is there any role for molecular genetic hybridization studies to better define the
clonal evolution of nephrogenic adenoma to adenocarcinoma as suggested in previous reports (Hartmann A et al, Hum Path 37:117, 2006; Wiener HG et al, Cancer 96:117, 2002)? This would further support the notion that the adenocarcinoma arose from a malignant transformation of the initially benign nephrogenic adenoma.


5. Consider putting an arrow in Figure 3 to demonstrate the histologic finding.

**What next?:** Revise and resubmit

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published