Reviewer's report

Title: Acute illness associated with Ehrlichia sp. P-Mtn from Atlanta, Georgia, USA: a case report

Version: 2 Date: 12 February 2008

Reviewer: Michael Rosenblum

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Presentations, diagnoses and/or management of new and emerging diseases

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

This is a persuasive presentation for a potential new cause of ehrlichia in humans. You have made it plain that the patient's symptomatology may have been the result of another causative agent that went unrecognized and this is of utmost importance. In the laboratory section of the presentation, the DNA sequences are not going to be significant for the majority of readers and should be removed to create a more concise abstract. The specifics of the testing though important do not need to be discussed at such length or specificity.

What next?: Accept after minor revisions

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published