Reviewer's report

Title: Acute Bilateral Simultaneous Angle Closure Glaucoma after Topiramate Administration

Version: 3 Date: 25 September 2007

Reviewer: Nathan Radcliffe

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Presentations, diagnoses and/or management of new and emerging diseases

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

In their article titled “Acute Bilateral Simultaneous Angle Closure Glaucoma after Topiramate Administration: a case report,” Chalam and colleagues describe a 34 year old female who presented with ciliochoroidal detachments and angle closure within 2 weeks of starting (and one week after increasing) topiramate therapy. The case report is clear and well written and the documentation, while good, is not perfect. Ultrasound biomicroscopy images demonstrating ciliochoroidal detachment would be a nice addition.

Topiramate was approved by the FDA in 1996 and the first case of angle closure associated with topiramate use was described in 2001.1 This was followed by a second and third report published in the same year.2-3 References 4-13 are subsequent publications on the topic.

While the authors have written a fine case report, it does not “expand(s) the field of general medical knowledge” as it does not contain any unique aspects that have not been reported previously. Therefore, this case report does not meet the guidelines for publication for JMCR (http://www.jmedicalcasereports.com/info/about/).
References.


--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Revisions necessary for publication
What next?: Reject

Quality of written English: Acceptable