Reviewer's report

Title: Congenital Arhinia

Version: 2 Date: 21 May 2007

Reviewer: Giorgio Iannetti

Comments to authors:

General

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Revisions necessary for publication

The authors present a new case of arhinia. According with the authors this congenital malformation is extremely rare, therefore it is usefull to public a new case. This article, however, needs some revisions.

The article is based on an inaccurate diagnosis and the records are not complete. The real definition of arhinia is the complete absence of the nasal pyramid and its osteo-cartilagineous structure associated with the partial absence of the olfactory system. The present case is probably better considered as a partial arhinia combined with various cerebral alterations. The referred alterations are not clear in the CT scans shown in the article and it would be necessary RMI scans for more precise evaluation. Since there are few cases published at the moment, this case is interesting but the article should be modified according to the comments made above. In particular the title should be re-evaluated and more evidence of the cerebral malformations should be provided.