Reviewer's report

Title: A Fatal Case of Bupropion (Zyban) Hepatotoxicity with Autoimmune Features

Version: 4 Date: 18 May 2007

Reviewer: John Greene Shepherd

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unreported or unusual side effects or adverse interactions involving medications.

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General
This case report is very well written with few distracting errors in grammar or spelling. The case in an interesting that is a probable drug reaction. However, I am not sure that it is any more likely to be due to Bupropion than Paroxetine. Both drugs have 2-3 rare case reports of associating them with causing hepatocellular injury. It is unknown if going off a drug after a long period and then starting back is protective.

------------------------------------------------------------------
Revisions necessary for publication
page 4 - Please clarify the duration of bupropion therapy in the second paragraph.

After his inital discharge what, if any, outpatient drugs were restarted?

Page 8, second paragraph - The sentence "This finding was recently validated ..." needs a citation. Also, regarding the use of Hy's rule or Hy's law you should be consistent.

Page 9 1st paragraph - The sentence "There is anecdotal evidence that ..." needs a citation.

What next?: Revise and resubmit

Quality of written English: Acceptable