Reviewer's report

Title: Sublingual epidermoid cyst: a case report

Version: 3 Date: 13 July 2007

Reviewer: Giorgio Iannetti

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General

Thank you very much for submitting your article to the “Journal of Medical Case Reports”.

Sublingual Epidermoid Cyst is an unusual localization of the disease, but in your case report is not clear why you performed thyroid scintigraphy as first step of the diagnostic process.

In fact, in the discussion of your article, is presented a diagnostic algorithm without thyroid scintigraphy.

You should explain more extensively surgical technique as well as the reason for which a midline submental incision was performed.

Furthermore, you have to clarify in the conclusion of your case report, your imaging technique management and the reason for which thyroid scintigraphy is needed.

Revisions necessary for publication
Focus on the importance of scintigraphy in the preoperative assessment and why you performed it as first step.

Is scintigraphy important in the diagnostic process of this particular case? If yes, why?

Moreover, the surgical technique performed to remove the cyst is not explained in a clear manner. For example, you don’t describe if you have used an intraoral or extraoral approach and how exactly the incision was made along the midline of the neck (horizontal, vertical…)

Figure 2 is of poor quality.

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable