Reviewer's report

Title: Concomitant Pulmonary and Hepatic Toxicity Secondary to Nitrofurantoin

Version: 2 Date: 25 May 2007

Reviewer: Henry Kwok

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unreported or unusual side effects or adverse interactions involving medications

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

General

Comments to the author:

1. How long had the patient taken the nitrofurantoin before the admission?
2. The patient was given steroid together with amoxicillin on initial presentation to the general practitioner, in addition to her usual medication of fluticasone. These implied that the patient was treated as asthma for her breathlessness. Had the authors excluded asthma as the cause of increase dyspnea? A normal spirometry (values not given in the manuscript) did not exclude asthma attack.
3. Why will the patient deteriorate despite treatment with a five day course of prednisone by the general practitioner?
4. Liver biopsy results: can the author show us the liver biopsy histology?
5. Follow up PFT results after withdrawal of nitrofurantoin—any available?

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Revisions necessary for publication

What next?: Accept after minor revisions

Quality of written English: Acceptable