Reviewer's report

Title: Concomitant Pulmonary and Hepatic Toxicity Secondary to Nitrofurantoin

Version: 2 Date: 11 May 2007

Reviewer: Nelson Lee

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unreported or unusual side effects or adverse interactions involving medications

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

General
It is an interesting case report on concomitant pulmonary and hepatotoxicity following nitrofurantoin treatment. This may add to the existing knowledge on this rare condition. However, there are several issues that need clarification.

1. When was nitrofurantoin started for this patient? (It was just mentioned in the manuscript that the 'dose' of the drug was stepped up for a few months.)
2. The patient had a pre-existing lung disease, labelled as 'asthma'. Was there any investigation to support this? Any old chest X-ray to show that there was no interstitial change before nitrofurantoin treatment?
3. Can these manifestations related to an underlying autoimmune disease?
4. Why was the steroid continued after admission?
5. Did the patient's symptoms recur after steroid cessation?

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Revisions necessary for publication

In addition to the above, the author should discuss briefly:

1. The possible mechanisms of nitrofurantoin induced organ toxicities.
2. The possible risk factors of these adverse reactions.
3. The histological features of nitrofurantoin induced hepatotoxicity. Is it compatible in this case?
4. A few alternatives on the treatment of recurrent UTI in post-menopausal women apart from the use of cranberry juice.
5. Consider revising the statement "....we felt confident that..." as it sounds a bit too strong with the data presented

What next?: Revise and resubmit

Quality of written English: Acceptable