Reviewer's report

Title: Severe hypercalcaemia and lymphoma in an HTLV-1 positive Jamaican woman: case report

Version: 2 Date: 12 May 2007

Reviewer: Julian W Tang

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General

This is a well-presented, well-written report of a typical case of HTLV-1 adult T-cell leukemia/lymphoma. It will be instructive to clinical trainees, but the problem is that it is so typical.

There are several previous case series reported, as listed below that also demonstrate the co-existence of hypercalcaemia in HTLV-1 ATLL patients, including one from the UK that also describes 2 elderly Jamaican patients (Edwards et al. 2003).

Unless the authors can find something more unique about this case, I cannot find sufficient reason, according to the stipulated Journal of Medical Case Reports criteria, for its publication in its current form.

However, having written many case reports myself, which have often required multiple submissions to various different journals, I fully understand the disappointment that can arise from a flat rejection, after putting in so much work, without giving the authors a chance to respond to reviewers' comments.

Therefore, I have suggested a 'revise and resubmit' decision to the journal editors, to give the authors a chance to provide some extra information that will make this case more unique and significantly different from those listed below, to make it more worthy of publication.

Previously reported, similar cases:


Revisions necessary for publication

To present further findings (if any) that make this case uniquely different to those previously published and listed in the references below:


**What next?:** Revise and resubmit

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable