Reviewer's report

Title: Isolated radial head dislocation A rare and easily missed injury in the presence of major distracting injuries - A case report

Version: 2 Date: 30 May 2007

Reviewer: Ruby Grewal

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

General
• This is an interesting case report of a isolated radial head dislocation in an adult who sustained polytrauma, without other upper extremity injuries.
• It serves as a reminder of the importance of a thorough secondary survey, including testing forearm pronation and supination in the setting of multi-trauma.

Revisions necessary for publication
• At the present time, there is a significant amount of information missing in this case report.
• The authors should make an attempt at answering a few additional questions:
  o Was there a history of previous elbow injury or arthritis?
  o Is there any other significant past medical history (i.e. connective tissue disorder)?
  o Details of clinical exam should be presented
  o Details of treatment should be included: For example, the duration of immobilization, position of immobilization (degrees of flexion and supination) and the post immobilization protocol (rehabilitation).
  o There should be some indication of the final results, or information regarding follow-up of either short or long term results (ROM/pain/function).
  o Radiographs: Authors should mention details regarding: plastic deformation of ulna, associated ligamentous injury as this may be related to the radial head dislocation.
  o Were additional imaging studies obtained? i.e. MRI, CT, stress views

• Describe radiographic findings in detail.
  o The images are not clear, but may suggest bone spurs near coronoid, shadow near reduced radial head. Please confirm.
  o How was an associated radial neck/head fracture ruled out? (CT scan?)

• Include a more thorough literature review: for example, the following articles are also relevant:
What next?: Revise and resubmit

Quality of written English: Acceptable