Reviewer’s report

Title: Synchronous Colonic Carcinomas Presenting as an Inguinoscrotal Hernial Mass: A Case Report and Literature Review.

Version: 2 Date: 25 March 2007

Reviewer: Marcus Quek

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General

The authors describe a case of a 69- year old man with synchronous colonic tumors involving the ascending and transverse colons presenting initially as an incarcerated inguinal hernia. Although the finding of a colonic carcinoma in an inguinal hernia has been reported previously, a transverse colon lesion is unique.

1. Based on the description of the tumor location and Figure 1, it is unclear how the tumor “in the transverse colon at the splenic flexure” could reach down into the scrotum. Were the colonic attachments at the splenic flexure disrupted from any prior surgeries? Was the spleen in its orthotopic location? Was this simply a very redundant transverse colon with the tumor located more in the mid portion of the transverse colon (as opposed to near the splenic flexure)? This needs to be discussed as this is what makes this case truly unique.

2. If the patient was suspected of having a colon malignancy preoperatively (thickening of colon wall), was consideration given to performing a lower GI endoscopy to evaluate the remainder of the colon either intraoperatively or preoperatively. Was a preoperative metastatic survey performed?

3. Was there any evidence of invasion into the spermatic cord? With evidence of a T3 lesion, should the patient have been managed with a concomitant orchietomy to ensure an adequate resection margin?

4. The citations listed in Table 1 should also be listed in the References section.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Revisions necessary for publication

YES- see above comments

What next?: Revise and resubmit

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published