Reviewer's report

Title: Hepatotoxicity induced by horse ATG and reversed by rabbit ATG: A case report

Version: 2 Date: 21 May 2007

Reviewer: Karen L Hardinger

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unreported or unusual side effects or adverse interactions involving medications

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

General
This is a well written case report of possible horse ATG induced hepatotoxicity.

Revisions necessary for publication

Further description of the case is warranted. Were the patient's vital signs stable throughout the horse ATG administration? Was a liver biopsy or hepatic imaging performed? Do you have data on the amount of conjugated and unconjugated bilirubin? Did the patient have any other significant past medical history? Can the authors speculate as to why the ALT was elevated before horse ATG infusion? Was the patient on any other medications? How long was horse ATG infused?

Please describe the influence of other medications in this patient. Further description of fluconazole toxicity is necessary. Do the authors think that fluconazole or other medications (ie Bactrim) could have caused the elevated liver enzymes? Was fluconazole every reinitiated? If so did the liver numbers rise again?

The authors state that hepatotoxicity has been described with the use of polyclonal antibody agents. Please give a more detailed explanation of these reports. Can you compare this to your patient? Has hepatotoxicity been described with horse ATG and rabbit ATG?

Lastly the authors state that the cause of elevated liver functions test was multifactorial, yet the title of the manuscript clearly states that horse ATG caused it. Which is it??

What next?: Revise and resubmit

Quality of written English: Acceptable