Reviewer's report

Title: Atypical presentation of Renal Cell Carcinoma: A case report

Version: 4 Date: 28 March 2007

Reviewer: Charin Hanlon

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General
I am concerned that this is a fairly well known association, in fact much of the literature regarding FUO report renal cell carcinoma as one of the common malignancies. I would also argue that this patient did not simply present with fever, but with a palpable abdominal mass. This would rapidly lead to imaging studies, hence they never had fever of unknown origin, but rather fever and a palpable flank mass. It would seem rather routine to obtain imaging studies. I feel this unfortunately represents a rather common way that renal cell carcinoma would be recognized.

Revisions necessary for publication

What next?: Reject

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published