Reviewer's report

Title: Giant scrotal elephantiasis of inflammatory etiology: Case report

Version: 1 Date: 28 February 2007

Reviewer: Robert Rabenalt

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Presentations, diagnoses and/or management of new and emerging diseases

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General
The authors should be congratulated on the successful management of this rare and interesting patient. I have a few comments to make:

1. The scenario is sufficiently rare to be of interest for at least a European readership.

2. In the discussion about chronic lymphoedema perhaps complication such as superimposed acute infection should be mentioned, in particular necrotising fasciitis.

3. Generally, it is futile to employ conservative measures for the treatment of chronic lymphoedema of over ten years duration. Fibrosis of lymphatic channels and tissue is long established and regression is highly unlikely hence surgical management is almost always the only option. It should be emphasised that surgery is recommended to prevent disastrous complications particularly with diabetes and raised residual urine.

4. Perhaps it would be interesting to remind the readers about a classification of lymphoedema.

Revisions necessary for publication
Several grammatical errors and at times unfortunate choice of wording are apparent. All errors can not be listed here. Just as an example in line 5 of the abstract: diabetes mellitus was ruled out and not figured out. If possible the manuscript should be reviewed by a native English speaker.

What next?: Accept after minor revisions

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published