Reviewer's report

Title: Neck fracture of a cementless forged titanium alloy femoral stem following Total Hip Arthroplasty: a case report and review of the literature.

Version: 3 Date: 10 October 2007

Reviewer: Rob Zwartele

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: New associations or variations in disease processes

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

General
Case report on neck fracture of femoral stem implant with retrieval study and review of literature. This report is well documented and gives intersting information on different types of implant failure and the different factors involved.

Revisions necessary for publication
I am not sure if all orthopedic surgeons are well known with technical terms such as 'beach mark' 'intergranular fracture' so they should be explained.

The discussion should be more compact; some references are discussed in too many details and some information is double.

Figure 3 and figure 4 do not give additional information and could be left out.

What next?: Accept after minor revisions
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published