Reviewer's report

**Title:** Recurrence of hepatitis C virus during agranulocytosis and spontaneous clearance after recovery from cytopenia

**Version:** 5  **Date:** 9 November 2007

**Reviewer:** Tilman J Gerlach

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

**Has the case been reported coherently?:** Yes

**Is the case report authentic?:** Yes

**Is this case worth reporting?:** Yes

**Is the case report persuasive?:** Yes

**Does the case report have explanatory value?:** Yes

**Does the case report have diagnostic value?:** Yes

**Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?:** Yes

**Comments to authors:**

General

The case report presented by Gruener et al. describes the recurrence of HCV after acute infection and during agranulocytosis. This highlights a very interesting clinical observation which can be relevant for patients with positive anti-HCV antibodies who are immunocompromised or at risk of agranulocytosis. It also provides further evidence that HCV is under control of the cellular immune response.

The authors should comment on some minor points.

1. Details of propylthiouracil treatment
2. Mode of infection (if known)
3. Please provide follow up data evidencing negative HCV RNA at least six months after the last positive HCV RNA.

The manuscript is well written and needs no language editing

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Revisions necessary for publication

What next?: Accept after minor revisions

Quality of written English: Acceptable