Reviewer's report

Title: Vitamin C-induced hyperoxaluria causing reversible tubulointerstitial nephritis and chronic renal failure: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 8 October 2007

Reviewer: Brian Rayner

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

General
In principal I believe this case report merits publication. It reports case of acute on chronic renal failure caused by oxalosis due to excess vitamin C ingestion and exacerbated by malabsorption. The case presentation and histological findings support their diagnosis of oxalosis. Excessive ingestion of vitamin C is a widespread practice and thought by many to be harmless practice. This case report is important will alert clinicians and the public to the very serious dangers of this practice.

Revisions necessary for publication

This is a well written paper but in the current format it is a little long and can be shortened. The authors should acknowledge that there was no proof of malabsorption in this case (although quite suggestive) and hypocitraturia. I have had the slides reviewed by our renal histopathologists who report evidence of oxalosis in the vessels, and the authors may want to include this data.
What next?: Revise and resubmit

Quality of written English: Acceptable