Reviewer's report

Title: Chylous ascites associated with chylthorax; a rare sequela of penetrating abdominal trauma: a case report.

Version: 4 Date: 28 August 2007

Reviewer: AYMAN SOUBANI

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: New associations or variations in disease processes

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General
thank you for your response to the comments.
-----------------------------------------------------------------

Revisions necessary for publication

1. I would add to the first paragraph of the case report that the initial CXR showed pneumothorax for which the chest tube was inserted in the ED

2. Lack of radiological studies weakens the case report.

What next?: Reject

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published