Reviewer’s report

Title: Chylous ascites associated with chylthorax; a rare sequae of penetrating abdominal trauma: a case report.

Version: 3 Date: 21 July 2007

Reviewer: AYMAN SOUBANI

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: New associations or variations in disease processes

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General

The case report is interesting but lacks originality and does not add much value to the available literature. Furthermore, there is important data that is lacking

1. regarding the exploratory laparatomy: what was the etiology on the 3 liter hemoperitoneum? Did the patient have any surgical repair.

2. page 3 paragraph 3: the paragraph starts by "the thoracostomy tube was removed". It was not mentioned that the patient had chest tube. If so why? Did the patient have a pleural effusion on initial presentation or post operatively? How much? what what was the fluid analysis?

3. Duiiring the second admission, it appears the patient developed a right pleural effusion. How large was the effusion, and what were the findings of fluid analysis?

4. I suggest showing figures of the chest x-rays and/or CTs if available.

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Revisions necessary for publication

What next?: Reject

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published