Reviewer's report

Title: The use of nerve growth factor in herpetic keratitis: a case report

Version: 7 Date: 20 August 2007

Reviewer: Renata Rezende

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Findings that shed new light on the possible pathogenesis of a disease or an adverse effect

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General

Revisions necessary for publication

Comments

1. Background Section- first sentence: include the word “simplex” between herpes and virus

2. It was not clear if the corneal ulcer was an infectious epithelial keratitis or a neurotrophic keratitis, neither by the description in the case report nor by the photograph. That should be clarified.

3. If the ulcer was neurotrophic, we should not expect fast healing with acyclovir anyway, were lubricants associated with acyclovir treatment?

4. The acyclovir treatment was stopped after starting the treatment with NGF?

5. Was NGF treatment associated with any other medications that could have
helped healing such as lubricants or oitments?

6. Has the patient had any signs of AIDS or he was just HIV+?

7. Since the nerve growth factor has a role in viral reactivation and herpes keratitis would it be indicated in any form of HSV keratitis or only neurotrophic?

8. From October 2004 till today have you experienced NGF in other herpes keratitis cases to confirm the positive result shown in this report?

**What next?:** Revise and resubmit

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable