Reviewer's report

Title: Unsuspected Pneumocystis pneumonia in an HIV-seronegative patient with untreated lung cancer: a case report

Version: 3 Date: 27 July 2007

Reviewer: Graham Douglas

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General

Apologies for not liking your case report - but I have major concerns over your diagnosis of "Lung Cancer". This patient undoubtedly had PCP in association with a low CD4 count although HIV negative. I would consider her to have "idiopathic CD4 lymphocytopenia" - rare but well reported.

Your diagnosis of Lung Cancer is much less robust (in a 43 year old non-smoker) - has the cytology been reviewed by a Lung Pathologist? - were the cells mucin producing? etc. Nowadays Lung Cancer usually requires invasive specimens from bronchoscopy or metastatic sites. Her CXR & CT would be in keeping with PCP - so where do you think the BAC is? (accepting that this is a diffuse tumour).

Also: references 3, 7 & 8 were all written before HIV testing became available.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Revisions necessary for publication
What next?: Reject

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited