Reviewer’s report

Title: The Skiers Knee without Swelling or Instability - A Difficult Diagnosis.

Version: 4 Date: 12 March 2007

Reviewer: Gareth Davison

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Comments to authors:

GENERAL COMMENTS

This case report highlights a situation whereby a 30 year old male subject attended an accident and emergency unit following a high speed fall whilst skiing. The subject experienced persistent discomfort and pain around the knee joint radiating down to the mid-tibial region. Magnetic Resonance Imaging confirmed that extensive bone marrow oedema was evident within the lateral tibial plateau extending to the articular surface and involving the tibial spine. There was also a small focus of articular cartilage disruption but no cartilaginous defect. Advice such as immobilisation of the joint was provided by the orthopaedic physicians. The subject seems to be recovering well nearly one year on from the injury.

This reviewer applauds the authors for highlighting this case. Much clinical awareness is needed to help physicians when presented with a difficult diagnosis such as that reported within. On a general note, the grammar is excellent throughout, and the case report is well structured. There are a few minor issues/corrections that need to be addressed before this reviewer deems the work publishable (see below).

SPECIFIC COMMENTS

Abstract:
A few sentences are required to enhance the quality of the abstract. More information on ‘the case per se’ would be advantageous.

Case Report:
It may be beneficial to include information on the subject’s body mass and stature.

Page 4, paragraph 3, line 3: should read ‘The patient…’ as oppose to ‘He patient….’

Discussion:
An indication of the mechanism(s) involved in the cause of bone marrow oedema may be interesting to the reader.

What next?: Accept after minor revisions

Quality of written English: Acceptable