Reviewer's report

Title: The Skiers Knee without Swelling or Instability - A Difficult Diagnosis.

Version: 4  Date: 12 March 2007

Reviewer: john o'hare

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

General
An interesting case.
As an ED Physician though, I just wonder how many similar cases we would find if we MRI scanned every knee injury that didn't settle initially.
At presentation this man was walking, had no instability or effusion and had grossly normal x-rays. I personally would not have requested an MRI as it was unlikely to have changed our management, as in this case.

Revisions necessary for publication
In saying that however, there is still a learning point here. That is, don't dismiss patients as malingerers just because they have normal radiographs as there may still be underlying pathology. Treatment should be supportive, symptomatic and education..

What next?: Accept after minor revisions

Quality of written English: Acceptable