Reviewer's report

Title: Mesenteric panniculitis of the sigmoid colon. A case report and review of the literature

Version: 3 Date: 31 July 2007

Reviewer: Helen A Papadaki

I am familiar with the literature and believe that this case meets one of the 7 criteria for evaluation in the journal: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Comments to authors:

Overall, this is an interesting case report of rare disease, however there are two major issues:

1. The construction and syntax of the text is too poor and therefore, I do not believe that this case report is publishable in the present form. The text should be re-written in a correct editing.

2. I do not agree with authors' recommendation of radical surgery since there are cases in the literature that patients with retractile mesenteritis may also respond to immunosuppression therapy. The authors should comment on this treatment as well rather than provoke surgical procedure.

What next?: Revise and resubmit

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited