Reviewer’s report

Title: Thoracoscopic plication for a Huge Thoracic Meningocele in a Patient with Neurofibromatosis

Version: 3 Date: 16 October 2013

Reviewer: yu-chung wu

Reviewer’s report:

Chen and colleges reported a 48 y/o female presented with progressive dyspnea and a huge intrathoracic meningocele, who has been unsuccessfully treated by a thoracoscopic cystoperitoneal shunt initially, and then successfully treated by a thoracoscopic plication thereafter.

Symptomatic intrathoracic meningocele is a rare clinical scenario and the optimal treatment remains uncertain. Resection of the cyst with or without laminectomy to correct the spinal deformity, or a conservative cystoperitoneal shunt had been reported among the literature to treat the patients. The authors described a “novel” surgical technique as an alternative to resolve the problem, which may potentially interest the readers.

However, I have few suggestions for the authors to improve the quality of this report:

1. The authors need to clarify how the decision had been made to insert a shunt or to plicate the cyst by using a thoracoscopic approach instead of a total extirpation of the cyst and laminectomy through a thoracotomy, and add a paragraph to discuss the risk benefit ratio among them.
2. Is migration of the shunt a common problem? Further discussion regarding why it happened and how to avoid it should be mentioned in the manuscript.
3. The text of the manuscript should be professionally and succinctly re-written and English editing is definitely required.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.