Reviewer's report

Title: Video-Assisted Thoracoscopic Resection of a Giant Bulla in Vanishing Lung Syndrome and a Short Literature Review

Version: 1 Date: 8 October 2013

Reviewer: Andrea Imperatori

Reviewer's report:

Even if the issue is interesting and in theory with an important impact, the manuscripts does not achieve the main goal to give updated information on the field. The case report of a video-assisted thoracoscopic bullectomy is not an innovative technique being described already in the 1990’ (as cited by the Authors).

Moreover, the reported case does need a prolonged follow-up (greater than 3 months) to assess long-term results in term of pulmonary function, pain and recurrence.

The Authors reported as postoperative morbidity a controlateral bronchopneumonia treated by i.v. antibiotics and so “quickly” resolved to permit discharge in good general conditions on postoperative day 5. This sounds unusual. How did they diagnose pneumonia? How long did the patient receive intravenous antibiotics?

Postoperative spirometry was defined “perfectly normal”, but the Authors should report data. Did they observe any restrictive syndrome after pleurectomy?

Finally, the authors do not discuss any important limitation to their study.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.