Reviewer’s report

Title: Epicardial adipose excision slows the progression of porcine coronary atherosclerosis.

Version: 2 Date: 21 August 2013

Reviewer: Sonia Eiras

Reviewer’s report:

Because EAT volume was studied to be associated with CAD, the author’s approach for studying the role of cEAT on CAD progression is interesting because several studies have found the relationship between EAT volume and CAD severity. However, several major concerns regarding study design and results make confusing the data interpretation. Thus, the authors have described in the discussion section the limitations of the study.

a) As they have commented there is a limitation in the lack of sham-adipectomies in age- and gender matched pigs fed hypercaloric atherogenic diet. However, it is also important to compare the presence or the adiectomy of cEAT in the same coronary. Thus, atherosclerosis-pigs model should be enough for concluding the cEAT in the CAD progression without sham operated control. However, the accuracy of adipectomy and selection of coronary region is very important (middle, proximal, distal) and high sample size will reduce the variability of plaque length in the middle coronary.

b) The authors have explained that cEAT on the LAD was the most accessible site within the operative field of exposure compared to either the circumflex or right coronary arteries, which would lessen intraoperative trauma, morbidity and mortality, and the risk of postoperative complications. In this case, the author’s conclusions are limited to the main LAD and the analysis extension on the other coronaries will help to understand the role of cEAT on the atherosclerosis progression.

c) Curiously the adiponectin data was higher in obese than lean. How the authors explain this data?

Minor concerns:


Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

No conflict of interest