Reviewer’s report

Title: Modifiable factors contribute to limitation in physical activity following thoracotomy and lung resection: a prospective observational study

Version: 1 Date: 18 February 2014

Reviewer: Kandadai Seshadri Rammohan

Reviewer’s report:

1. The question asked is relevant and well defined
2. Yes - the methods are appropriate, well described and reproducible
3. Data – large dropout from original group – reasons described in text. Would be interesting to know who were non compliant and if there was any consistent reason for removal. Data drop should not affect study due to the nature of the design.
4. Good discussions, conclusions supported by the regression model
5. Is the writing acceptable – Definitely so

Statistical review

Is it essential that this manuscript is seen by an expert statistician? If so, please give your reasons in your report.

Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics – the conclusions hinge on the Preop FEV1 and level of Preop activity showing up as significant predictors in the model

Discretionary Revisions

1. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found – the modifiable factors specifically refer to the preoperative characteristics x 2 – that could be made clearer in the title and in the body – as there are a number of other modifiable factors that would affect mobility – as detailed in some of the discussion – pain, VATS usage, Epidural use etc.
2. There appears to be a trend to increasing use of epidural analgesia in the poor mobility group – cause and effect or a marker of a “sicker” patient group preop?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests