Reviewer's report

Title: Surgical treatment of esophageal carcinoma with curative intent: analysis of a single center experience.

Version: 1 Date: 23 November 2012

Reviewer: Mario Santini

Reviewer's report:

Discretionary Revisions
- In the analysis the authors considered only the presence of lymph node metastases (N0 vs N+) but they did not valuate if the number of lymph node involvement was an unfavorable prognostic factor in their series. Several studies have established that more extensive lymphadenectomy is associated with improved survival after esophageal surgery. At confirm of that, the number of lymph node is a major change in the new edition of TNM staging
- Did you look at extracapsular spreading of lymph node invasion?
- There are some English grammar errors; i.e: respectable instead of resectable (page 3; line 10); lymphoadenectomy instead of lymphadenectomy (page 3, line 11)

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests