Reviewer's report

Title: Surgical treatment of esophageal carcinoma with curative intent: analysis of a single center experience.

Version: 1 Date: 12 November 2012

Reviewer: Sergio Coda

Reviewer's report:

The authors reported a highly educative and comprehensive analysis of retrospectively collected records of 76 esophagectomies for esophageal carcinomas performed over a 10-year period at a world-renowned single high volume Institution.

Paper is excellently written and easy to read because document is well organized, with only a few minor typos and grammatical errors. A couple of minor grammatical revisions are recommended (see below).

Ideas and critical commentary are relevant to the topic, thoughtful, and demonstrate effort and a depth of understanding.

Data are easily accessible and appropriately presented. The conclusions of the study are clearly illustrated. An extensive discussion of existing relevant literature is provided.

I recommend this large case series wholeheartedly for publication with high priority.

Minor revisions:

Resectable (Introduction)

Bowel preparation was undertaken in all patients prior to surgery (Patients and Methods)

All operations were performed with curative intent and accomplished via right fifth intercostal space thoracotomy in the majority of cases (Patients and Methods)

trans-hiatal esophagectomy (Patients and Methods)

video-assisted (Patients and Methods)

water-soluble (Results)

and 19 had adenocarcinoma (Patients and Methods)

Furthermore (Comment)

Low or limited number of centers or few centers (Comment)
We performed a trans-hiatal esophagectomy only in 3 cases due to the junctional location of the tumor (Comment)

We preferred a two-field lymphadenectomy and notwithstanding a cervical anastomosis was done performed in all cases (Comment)

..survival data are conflicting; in addition, the alleged benefit of three-field lymphadenectomy has not been confirmed in a prospective randomized trial (Comment)

Lymphadenectomy (Introduction and Comment)

Wound dehiscence (Table 1)

**Level of interest:** An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.