Reviewer’s report

Title: Right Lower Lobectomy Eight Years After Left Pneumonectomy for a Second Primary Lung Cancer

Version: 2 Date: 22 January 2013

Reviewer: Jean Deslauriers

Reviewer’s report:

In this paper, the authors report on an interesting case where a right lower lobectomy was done for a second primary lung cancer in a patient who had had previously a left pneumonectomy also for cancer. The authors conclude that such surgery is possible in selected patients. In their discussion, the authors mention that very few similar cases have been previously reported. In my opinion, the problem with these patients is the vascular aspect of lung function and most will die postoperatively of acute pulmonary hypertension with secondary respiratory failure. The authors should discuss this issue and how it should be evaluated preoperatively. The authors should also discuss the fact that in the literature, most reported similar cases were done for benign disease where adjustments have already happened over previous years, a situation which is far different than that of lung cancer.

The authors should also explain why they did a lobectomy with major risk of postoperative death if the patient had subcarinal nodal metastases.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests