Reviewer's report

Title: Out come of surgical treatment for proximal long segment post intubation tracheal stenosis

Version: 1 Date: 26 December 2012

Reviewer: GIUSEPPE MARULLI

Reviewer's report:

The authors report their experience on a series of 20 patients treated with surgical resection and anastomosis of benign tracheal stenosis. Although the report covers a relatively large number of cases in a few period the paper suppers of many problems:

Major compulsory revisions

The reported data are not exhaustive, in particular in should be interesting to know the neurological status of the patients and the reason for having a trachestomy in place for all patients (e.g. Only for stenosis or for the association of other problems? the authors report that the stenosis was longer than 40% of the full lenght of the trachea however the mean trachea resected was about 4.1 cm +/- 0.5 this means that the mean lenght of the trachea was 11 cm that usually is typical of women, please comment on that. Authors conclude that laryngeal release is useful guaranteeing the best results, however no control group is present, therefore this sentence should be removed. Authors do not report significant swallowing problems that are very frequent after long tracheal resection and particularly after laryngeal release.

Minor essential revisions

The authors did not analize risk factor for complications, it would be interesting to know the characteristics of pts who developed postoperative complications. The paper is full of minor spelling and grammar english mistakes. An english revision by a native english speaker is advisable.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

no conflict of interest to declare