Reviewer's report

Title: Comparison of Left Ventricular Geometry after HeartMate II and HeartWare Left Ventricular Assist Device Implantation

Version: 1 Date: 8 November 2012

Reviewer: Vassilios VD Didilis

Reviewer's report:

Dear editor,

The paper of Morteza Tavakkoli Hosseini et al is about an interesting comparison of two left ventricular assist devices. It is examined whether the new, third generation, small volume assist devices and, to be more precise, the "HeartWare" (HW), is as effective as the most widely used “HeartMate II” (HM II). Perhaps a larger group of patients and longer monitoring periods should be used, and in addition, more parameters should be taken into account in order to give a more trustworthy answer to this question. However, since the authors have checked only one parameter, that is the Left Ventricular Geometry, they give a clear answer about this. That “both HM II and HW can significantly reduce the Left ventricular systolic and diastolic dimensions and off-load the left ventricle”.

I believe that their findings are interesting enough to be published.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests