Reviewer's report

Title: Comparison of Left Ventricular Geometry after HeartMate II and HeartWare Left Ventricular Assist Device Implantation

Version: 1 Date: 25 October 2012

Reviewer: Levente LF Fazekas

Reviewer's report:

Discretionary Revision
The paper of Morteza et al. is a landmark paper comparing the off-loading effect of HM II and HW LVADS on the left ventricle. The authors have stated that echocardiography data were collected at baseline pump speeds, which is 9600 rpm for HM II and 2800 rpm for HW. However, I assume there was a greater variability between patients own basal pump flows. I wonder how and why exactly these baseline speeds were selected and whether or not it would be more interesting to have this extra information on patients basal pump speeds. Collecting echocardiography data by these speeds it might have been possible to correlate the off-loading effect of VADS to actual pump flows.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests